ANALYSIS OF NUGENT AND AMSEL CRITERIA FOR THE DETECTION OF FEMALE GENITAL TRACT INFECTIONS IN A TERTIARY CARE HOSPITAL, COASTAL KARNATAKA

Kumari Nisha¹, Beena Antony²

¹Research Scholar, Department of Microbiology, Fr. Muller Medical College and Hospital, Mangaluru.
²Professor, Department of Microbiology, Fr. Muller Medical College and Hospital, Mangaluru.

ABSTRACT

BACKGROUND
Female genital tract infections are polymicrobial in nature. Among the genital infections, bacterial vaginosis is the most common infection caused by anaerobic and microaerophilic organisms such as Bacteroides fragilis group, Mobiluncus species, Porphyromonas species, Prevotella group and Gardnerella vaginalis. Objective- Comparative evaluation of Nugent and Amsel criteria in diagnosis of various types of female genital tract infections.

MATERIALS AND METHODS
The present descriptive study was conducted in a tertiary care hospital in coastal Karnataka, South India during the period from July 2013 to June 2016. Of the 1217 women under study, 1054 cases were taken with complaints of vaginal discharge and 163 were included as control, which belongs to normal vaginal flora, confirmed by microscopy in the Dept. of Microbiology, Father Muller Medical College, Mangalore. High vaginal swabs from women of reproductive age group (15 - 45 years) and 163 age matched control group were examined by preliminary examination.

RESULTS
By employing Amsel and Nugent criteria, out of 1054 vaginal samples 415 (39.4%) were Normal vaginal flora, Vaginal Lactobacillosis 117 (9.3%), Bacterial vaginosis 315 (29.9%), Intermediate Bacterial vaginosis 11 (1.0%), Vulvovaginitis 6 (0.6%), Cervicitis 4 (0.4%), HIV 2 (0.2%), Candidiasis 106 (10.1%), Group B Streptococcus with Antenatal cases 73 (6.9%) and Trichomoniasis 5 (0.5%). No vaginal infections were detected from the control group.

CONCLUSION
BV, Candidiasis, Trichomoniasis and Vulvovaginitis are the most common conditions present among female genital tract infections. Nugent and Amsel criteria are the most cost effective and less time-consuming tests for the diagnosis of vaginal infections.

KEYWORDS
Nugent’s Criteria, Amsel’s Criteria, Bacterial Vaginosis, Vaginal Discharge Candidiasis, Trichomoniasis.


1. Sexually transmitted disease (STD) organisms which include Neisseria gonorrhoeae, Chlamydia trachomatis, Herpes simplex and Trichomonas vaginalis,
2. Mixed aerobes and anaerobes,

In genital infection, mixed aerobes and anaerobes cause bacterial vaginosis (BV), vulvovaginitis, tubo-ovarian abscesses, cervicitis, postsurgical and post-partum infections. Of these infections BV is the most common infection found in vaginal tract which causes vaginal discharge and thus leading to vaginal disorder in women of reproductive age.

The present study was intended to perform the comparative evaluation of Nugent and Amsel criteria in diagnosis of various types of female genital tract infections in a tertiary care hospital, Karnataka.

MATERIALS AND METHODS
The present descriptive study was conducted in a tertiary care hospital in Coastal Karnataka, South India, during the period from July 2013 to June 2016. Ethical clearance was obtained for the study (Ref. No. FMCC/ FMEC/ 1298/ 2013) and written informed consent was duly collected from the patients or attendants.
Source and Collection of Data
High vaginal swabs from 1054 women of the reproductive age group in the (15 - 45) were suspected to have BV and other female genital tract infections such as itching, irritation or burning, discomfort urination, douching, using contraceptive device, infertility cases, pre-term birth and pelvic inflammatory disease constitute the test. Control group number 163 included from healthy women in the reproductive age group without any white discharge, attending for family planning consultation were collected from the Department of Gynaecology and Obstetrics. Non-random, convenient sampling technique was used.

A detailed clinical history for each woman was noted which included age, sex, severity of problem and other illnesses etc. were taken from medical records. Women with menstrual period and patients who were on medication and clinically diagnosed for any bacterial, fungal, parasitic or viral infections for upto one month prior to the specimen collection and women with diabetes mellitus were excluded from the study.

Three high vaginal swabs were collected per patient aseptically. Vaginal secretions or discharge were collected from the posterior and lateral fornices cervix area. Cervical or high vaginal swabs were collected with the help of Cusco’s speculum and inoculated into sterile tube containing 0.5 mL normal saline and immediately transported to the Department of Microbiology for the further processing.

Diagnosis of Female Genital Tract Infections
Diagnosis was done based on Amsel and Nugent criteria.

Amsel’s Criteria
The Vaginal Discharge was subjected to the following Tests-

- **Appearance**: Appearance of the discharge was clear to white and homogeneous.
- **pH Test**: pH of the discharge was tested by using pH paper, which showed a wide pH range of 1 - 14 (HiMedia Laboratories, Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai, India).
- **Whiff Test**: Microorganisms produced amines, which is present in the vaginal discharge. The organisms which involved in BV volatilise in the presence of alkaline pH giving a fishy smell.
- **Clue Cells**: Presence of clue cells were confirmed by screening the vaginal discharge by gram stain. Clue cells are the vaginal squamous epithelial cells studded with large number gram variable coccobacillary forms.
- **According to Amsel’s Criteria**: According to Amsel’s Criteria: If three of the above four criteria were positive, the patient was considered to be suffering from female genital tract infections.7

Procedures:

**pH Determination**
A swab of vaginal discharge was put onto litmus paper to check its acidity. A colour reaction developed on the paper was compared to a colour comparison chart to determine the pH of the sample. pH > 4.5 indicated BV.

Amine Odour Test (Whiff Test)
Amines present in the vaginal discharge produced by the microorganisms were involved in BV. A drop of 10% potassium hydroxide (KOH) was added to some vaginal discharge put in a clean glass slide. A characteristic fishy odour was considered as positive amine odour test and was suggested of BV.

Wet Mount
A drop of vaginal discharge suspension was placed on a slide and covered with coverslip. Slide was examined microscopically using a 40x objective. Test was analysed for determination of epithelial clue cells and pus cells, T. vaginalis (TV) and Candida specie.

Nugent Score and Interpretation Criteria

**Gram Stain**
High vaginal discharge smeared on clean glass slides, air dried, heat fixed and stained by Gram’s method using acetone alcohol (1: 1) mixture as decolouriser and dilute carbol fuchsin as the counter stain. The numbers of “clue” cells, various morphotypes of bacteria and normal epithelial cells were estimated.8

**Nugent’s Criteria**
Nugent criteria is a gold standard method for detection of female genital tract infections, which is based on interpretation of Gram stain of vaginal discharge. Nugent criteria summed the weighted quantitation (0, 1 to 4+) of the following morphotypes to yield a score of 0 to 10 for each case, large gram-positive rods (Lactobacillus morphotypes weighted such that absence yielded the highest score), small gram-negative to gram-variable rods (G. vaginalis and Bacteroides spp. morphotypes) and curved gram-variable rods (Mobiluncus spp. morphotypes). The criterion for bacterial vaginosis was a score of 7 or higher, a score of 4 to 6 was considered intermediate and a score of 0 to 3 was considered normal.9 Table 1 and 2 shows the Nugent’s criteria methods. In the present study, Nugent’s criteria method was considered as gold standard method compared to Amsel’s criteria.

**Statistical Analysis**
Statistical analysis was done using SPSS version 23. Fisher’s exact test was applied for data analysis and Chi-square test used for comparative analysis between Amsel and Nugent criteria. The sensitivity, specificity, positive predictive value and negative predictive value were calculated by Chi-square test.

**Nugent Score an Interpretation Criteria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Morphotype</th>
<th>Number of Organism per Oil Immersion Field (Average 10 Field)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lactobacillus species</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gardnerella and Anaerobic GNB</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curved GNB Mobiluncus Species</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 1**
NEGATIVE PREDICTIVE VALUE

Processing. Hence, a smear scoring system was compared to Amsel and Nugent criteria. Of the 1054 vaginal samples such as Trichomonas vaginalis 5 (0.5%), G. vaginalis 223 (21.2%) and Candida spp. 106 (10.1%). Table 5 shows results of female genital tract infections prevalent in 1054 cases with 163 age matched control group.

Table 6 shows comparison results of Amsel and Nugent criteria in female genital tract infection cases. The sensitivity, specificity, positive predictive value and negative predictive value were calculated which indicates Nugent’s criteria is the best method for diagnosis of female genital tract infections compared to Amsel’s criteria.

Table 5. Details of the Clinical Conditions of Cases and Controls

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>Clinical Condition</th>
<th>Cases</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Control</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Normal vaginal flora</td>
<td>415</td>
<td>39.4</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>578 (47.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Vaginal Lactobacillosis</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>117 (9.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Bacterial vaginosis</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>29.9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>315 (25.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Intermediate vaginal flora</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>11 (0.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>Vulvovaginitis</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>6 (0.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.</td>
<td>Cervicitis</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>4 (0.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>2 (0.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H.</td>
<td>Candidiasis</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>106 (8.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Antenatal cases with Group B Streptococcus</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>73 (6.0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.</td>
<td>Trichomoniasis</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>5 (0.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>1054</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>1217 (100.0%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fisher’s exact test p value = 0.00 < 0.001, highly significant

Table 6. Comparison of Amsel and Nugent Methods from Female Genital Tract Infections

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Methods</th>
<th>Sensitivity %</th>
<th>Specificity %</th>
<th>Positive Predictive Value %</th>
<th>Negative Predictive Value %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amsel’s criteria</td>
<td>57.72</td>
<td>98.79</td>
<td>78.61</td>
<td>96.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nugent’s criteria</td>
<td>96.81</td>
<td>78.61</td>
<td>57.72</td>
<td>98.79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. Preliminary Examination (TV, GV, G, C) of Vaginal Swabs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>Positive</th>
<th>Negative</th>
<th>Fisher Exact Test p value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trichomonas Vaginalis (TV)</td>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. vaginalis (GV)</td>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>21.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gonococci (G)</td>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candida spp. (C)</td>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>10.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DISCUSSION

Female genital tract infections include a spectrum of clinical conditions such as Bacterial vaginosis, Pelvic inflammatory disease, Trichomoniasis, Vulvovaginitis, Candidiasis etc. BV is found to be the most common vaginal disorder in women of reproductive age. BV can predispose to obstetrical infections, post aortal, pelvic inflammatory disease, post-partum endometritis after caesarean, prevalence of BV obtained in patients with infertility, preterm labour.10

Initial screening of these infections was done by direct microscopy. As implied in the literature, Amsel’s criteria is less sensitive than gram stain interpretation in cases of BV.7,11 Amsel’s criteria is the best method for routine diagnosis of vaginal infections.

Previous studies reported that Nugent’s criteria is the best method for diagnosis of BV.14-16 Based on direct smear examination, it can classify gram vaginal smears into normal vaginal flora, intermediate BV and BV. The standardised score had improved Spiegel criteria, which divides gram stain into two categories- normal vaginal flora and BV.9,17 Few studies have tried to formulate that gram stain scoring system was better, but are not popular as Nugent’s criteria for diagnosis of BV.10,19
Kusters and their colleagues performed a comparative study by using a multiplex real-time PCR assay and Nugent's score diagnosis of BV. They reported that multiplex qPCR was a better method for diagnosis of BV compared to the Nugent's score.

In the present study, Amsel criteria and Nugent criteria were compared for the diagnosis of female genital tract infections. In comparison with Amsel's method, Nugent's Criteria was found to be 96.81% sensitive, 78.61% specific with positive predictive value of 57.72 and negative predictive value of 98.79%. In the present study, Nugent's criteria were found to be gold standard method compared to Amsel's criteria p.000, highly sensitive.

In a study by Udayalakshmi J et al, Amsel's criteria, Spiegel's and Nugent's criteria are reported equally effective methods for the diagnosis of BV, whereas another study reported Amsel's criteria is less sensitive to Nugent's criteria.

Indian studies conducted on general population have shown the prevalence of BV as 19% by Nugent's scoring system. In a previous Indian study the prevalence of BV was observed as the highest in Urban slum 38.6%, Rural 28.8% and Urban middle class community 25.4%.

However, the present study conducted on the Rural and Urban middle class community has shown the prevalence of BV 29.9% and Intermediate BV 1% by Nugent's scoring system.

Vaginal Lactobacillus is a condition mostly found in the reproductive age group of women with odourless, white vaginal discharge and vulvovaginal itching. In a study reported by Ventolini G 15% prevalence of Vaginal Lactobacillus in women, whereas the present study was observed a prevalence of 11.1% Vaginal Lactobacillus.

A study reported by Doyle C and their colleagues, Trichomonas vaginalis was significantly associated from premenstrual syndrome with headache. However, some other studies have reported 4% and 1.5% Trichomoniasis from infected women. In the present study, 5 (0.5%) Trichomoniasis was observed.

Dagli and Demir had reported Candida spp. (7.3%), whereas in other studies Candidiasis was obtained in 20% and 16.5% respectively. In present study, 10.1% Candida species was analysed from the genital tract infections. Powell and Nyirjesy reported some of the commonly encountered problems in women like Vulvovaginitis, Vuhovaginal Candidiasis, BV and Trichomoniasis.

The present study evaluates the value of direct and preliminary examinations of vaginal discharge from infectious women by using Nugent and Amsel criteria. The time required to diagnose female genital tract infections by culture and other sophisticated newer methods will require longer time. Therefore, our study employs cost effective and less time-consuming methods to analyse these infections by Gram stain, pH test, whiff test and wet mount.

CONCLUSION

Female genital tract infections namely BV, Candidiasis, Trichomoniasis and Vulvovaginitis affect the socio-economic conditions of the women in India. Nugent and Amsel criteria are the most cost effective and less time-consuming methods for the diagnosis of such vaginal infections as compared to the traditional culture technique.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors would like to acknowledge Dr. Annie, Dr. Prema, Dr. Deepa and Dr. Mahesh from Dept. from Gynaecology, Father Muller Medical College for the support extended during collection of vaginal samples.

REFERENCES


